

# Table of Contents

Preface	iii
List of Contributors	v
Chapter 1. Rush Rhees: The Reality of Discourse DAVID COCKBURN	1
Chapter 2. Peter Winch: Philosophy as the Art of Disagreement LARS HERTZBERG	23
Chapter 3. R. F. Holland: Absolute Ethics and the Challenge of Compassion HEIDI NORTHWOOD	49
Chapter 4. J. R. Jones: ‘How Do I Know Who I Am?’ The Passage from Objects to Grammar WALFORD GEALY	69
Chapter 5. Howard Mounce: Wittgensteinian Transcendent Realism? MICHAEL WESTON	103
Chapter 6. D. Z. Phillips: Contemplation, Understanding, and the Particularity of Meaning JOHN EDELMAN	125
Chapter 7. İlham Dilman: The Reality of the Human CHRYSSI SIDIROPOULOU	159
Chapter 8. R. W. Beardsmore: Understanding Moral Judgement JOHN WHITTAKER	187
Chapter 9. Rhees, Wittgenstein, and the Swansea School MARIO VON DER RUHR	219



## Preface

The idea for this collection of essays arose out of conversations I had with D. Z. Phillips in Claremont in 2000: a set of philosophical essays recognizing and arising out of something I took to be both interesting and good going on at University College, Swansea, roughly from the 1950s into the 1990s. I envisioned eight essays, each in some way taking up the work of one of eight individuals – Rush Rhees, Peter Winch, R. F. Holland, J. R. Jones, H. O. Mounce, D. Z. Phillips, İlham Dilman, and R. W. Beardsmore – each of whom taught at Swansea for a substantial period during those years, these being followed by a ninth essay providing something of an overview of the other eight essays and thereby of philosophy at Swansea during the same period.

When writing to the individuals I hoped would contribute to the collection I tried to convey what sort of essays I was looking for by observing that it would be ‘inconsistent with what seemed to me best at Swansea’ if the essays were to focus much at all on the personalities or individual ‘achievements’ of the philosophers whose work was to be under discussion. The point, I went on to say, was the work itself and a discussion of it that was carried on in the same critical and, in Simone Weil’s sense of the term, ‘impersonal’ manner that I took to be part of the strength of philosophy at Swansea, at least as I knew it.

It is for others to judge the worth of the project as an idea and the success of the essays here collected. But I should like to express my gratitude to each of the contributors, who in very different ways show in their essays a consistent appreciation of the character or, perhaps, the spirit in which philosophy was, if not always or everywhere, at least largely and consistently for several decades, pursued at Swansea. At the same time I should like to note my sense of gratitude to the individuals, both living and deceased, who are the subjects of these essays, for it seems to me that each played a significant role in creating and maintaining that quality or spirit of philosophical inquiry that I identify with the Swansea of those years.

Given the subject or subjects of the collection, a word should perhaps be said about the expression ‘Swansea School’. As Dewi Phillips noted on many occasions, this was not a term given to themselves by Swansea’s philosophers, and there is a good deal in these essays, I think, that should make evident the inappropriateness of the expression. On the other hand, as Mario von der Ruhr’s essay makes clear, there was something to be found at Swansea in those years that might rightly prompt the use of some such term. Indeed, it appears to me, as I believe it might to others who experienced philosophical *discussion* at Swansea – especially in the weekly meetings of the Philosophical Society founded by Rush Rhees in the 1940s and carried on into the 1990s – that what was distinctive and, I should say, quite remarkable, about that experience cannot be identified with the presence or participation of one or two individuals but belonged in some sense to the place, that is, to the department, though by no means to all of it. What indeed was distinctive I have not, after nearly thirty years as a ‘professional’ philosopher, found elsewhere; but it may at moments be evident to some in the essays that follow.

Finally, I am grateful to my colleague, Heidi Northwood, for her help with the preparation and the proofreading of the text.

John Edelman  
Nazareth College  
Rochester, New York  
March, 2009

## List of Contributors

David Cockburn is Professor of Philosophy at University of Wales, Lampeter. He has taught at the University of Wales, Swansea, the Open University and Åbo Akademi, and held a British Academy Readership from 1994-96. He is the author of *Hume* (Open University Press, 1983), *Other Human Beings* (Macmillan, 1990), *Other Times: Philosophical Perspectives on Past, Present and Future* (Cambridge University Press, 1997), and *An Introduction to the Philosophy of Mind* (Palgrave, 2001), and editor of *Human Beings* (Cambridge University Press, 1991).

John Edelman is Professor of Philosophy at Nazareth College of Rochester (USA). He is the author of *An Audience for Moral Philosophy?* (Macmillan, 1991). His essays and reviews have appeared in *Philosophical Investigations*, *The International Philosophical Quarterly*, *Faith and Philosophy*, and in the collections *The Possibilities of Sense* (Palgrave, 2002) and *Religion and Wittgenstein's Legacy* (Ashgate, 2005).

Walford Gealy is *emeritus* Senior Lecturer of the University of Wales, Aberystwyth. He read philosophy at Swansea in the late fifties and early sixties before studying under G. E. M. Anscombe at Oxford. He has published widely, including a volume (in Welsh) entitled *Wittgenstein*. He was also, for fifteen years, the joint editor of the only Welsh language philosophy journal, *Efrydiau Athronyddol (Philosophical Studies)* and for some years an associate editor of the journal *Philosophical Investigations*.

Lars Hertzberg studied philosophy with Erik Stenius at the University of Helsinki and with Norman Malcolm at Cornell University. He is professor *emeritus* in philosophy at Åbo Akademi, in Turku, Finland. His publications include *The Limits of Experience* (1994), and a number of scholarly articles as well as translations of Wittgenstein into Swedish.

Heidi Northwood is Professor of Philosophy at Nazareth College of Rochester. She has published articles in *Philosophical Investigations* and *Epoché*.

Mario von der Ruhr is Lecturer in Philosophy at Swansea University and Associate Editor of *Philosophical Investigations*. He has also co-edited the series *Claremont Studies in Philosophy of Religion* with D. Z. Phillips and is the author of *Simone Weil – An Apprenticeship in Attention*. His published articles are in philosophy of religion, ethics and philosophical anthropology.

Chryssi Sidiropoulou received a B.A. degree in Philosophy and Psychology from the Aristotle University, Thessaloniki, Greece. She earned her Ph.D. at the University of Wales, Lampeter, under the supervision of David Cockburn and D. Z. Phillips. The title of her Ph.D. thesis is ‘Wittgenstein, the Self, and Religious Life’ (1996). Since 1996 she has been teaching in the Philosophy Department of Bogazici University, Istanbul, Turkey. Her interests include philosophy of mind, philosophy of religion, Wittgenstein, and ancient philosophy.

Michael Weston is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Essex, U.K. He is author of *Kierkegaard and Modern Continental Philosophy* and *Philosophy, Literature and the Human Good*.

John H. Whittaker (Ph.D. Yale, 1974) has taught at the University of Virginia and more recently at Louisiana State University, where he served for a time as Chairman of the Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies. He acquired his sympathies for Kierkegaard and Wittgenstein at Yale from Paul Holmer, and met D. Z. Phillips shortly thereafter and R. W. Beardsmore some time later. He published *Matters of Faith and Matters of Principle: Religious Truth Claims and Their Logic* in 1981, *The Logic of Religious Persuasion* in 1990, and is currently working on another book, *God in Contemplative Perspective*.